

1 XAVIER BECERRA
2 Attorney General of California
3 MARK R. BECKINGTON
4 ANTHONY R. HAKL
5 Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
6 GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN, SBN 267308
7 TODD GRABARSKY, SBN 286999
8 R. MATTHEW WISE, SBN 238485
9 ANNA T. FERRARI, SBN 261579
10 Deputy Attorneys General
11 1300 I Street, Suite 125
12 P.O. Box 944255
13 Sacramento, CA 94244-2550
14 Telephone: (415) 510-3779
15 Fax: (916) 324-8835
16 E-mail: Anna.Ferrari@doj.ca.gov
17 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California, by and*
18 *through Attorney General Xavier Becerra*

19
20 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
21
22 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
23
24

25
26 **STATE OF CALIFORNIA by and through**
27 **Attorney General Xavier Becerra;**
28 **COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES; CITY OF**
1 LOS ANGELES; CITY OF FREMONT;
2 CITY OF LONG BEACH; CITY OF
3 OAKLAND; CITY OF STOCKTON,

4 Plaintiffs,

5 **v.**

6 **WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official**
7 **capacity as Secretary of the U.S.**
8 **Department of Commerce; U.S.**
9 **DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE; RON**
10 **JARMIN, in his official capacity as Acting**
11 **Director of the U.S. Census Bureau; U.S.**
12 **CENSUS BUREAU; DOES 1-100,**

13 Defendants.

14
15 3:18-cv-01865

16
17 **STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]**
18 **ORDER FOR LEAVE TO CONDUCT**
19 **TRIAL DEPOSITION OF EXPERT**
20 **WITNESS PAMELA KARLAN;**
21 **DECLARATION OF ANNA T.**
22 **FERRARI; DECLARATION OF**
23 **PAMELA S. KARLAN**

24
25 Dept: 3
26 Judge: The Honorable Richard G.
27 Seeborg
28 Trial Date: January 7, 2019
Action Filed: March 26, 2018

1
2 **CITY OF SAN JOSE, a municipal**
3 **corporation; and BLACK ALLIANCE FOR**
4 **JUST IMMIGRATION, a California Non-**
5 **Profit Corporation,**

6
7 Plaintiffs,

8 v.
9

10 **WILBUR L. ROSS, JR., in his official**
11 **capacity as Secretary of the U.S.**
12 **Department of Commerce; U.S.**
13 **DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE; RON**
14 **JARMIN, in his official capacity as Acting**
15 **Director of the U.S. Census Bureau; U.S.**
16 **CENSUS BUREAU,**

17 Defendants.
18

19 Case No. 5:18-cv-02279
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

**STIPULATION FOR LEAVE TO CONDUCT TRIAL DEPOSITION OF EXPERT
WITNESS PAMELA KARLAN**

Plaintiffs, Plaintiff-in-Intervention, and Defendants in the cases of *California et al. v. Ross et al.*, 18-cv-1865 and *San Jose et al. v. Ross et al.*, 18-cv-2279, hereby stipulate as follows:

1. The parties seek an order pursuant to Civil Local Rule 6-2 to conduct a *de bene esse* deposition of the Plaintiffs' expert witness, Professor Pamela Karlan, and to modify the discovery deadline as needed in order to do so, in light of Professor Karlan's unavailability to appear during trial.

2. Professor Karlan is the Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law at Stanford Law School and has offered expert testimony on behalf of Plaintiffs regarding whether the addition of a citizenship question to the decennial census would assist the Department of Justice in enforcing section 2 of the Voting Rights Act. Declaration of Pamela S. Karlan (“Karlan Decl.”) ¶¶ 1-3.

3. Professor Karlan has submitted an expert report on behalf of Plaintiffs that was timely disclosed to Defendants on September 19, 2018. Declaration of Anna Ferrari (“Ferrari Decl.”) ¶ 2. Defendants deposed Professor Karlan on October 25, 2018, in Palo Alto, California. *Id.* ¶ 3.

4. For the first three months of 2019, Professor Karlan will be traveling abroad to satisfy a professional commitment associated with her teaching duties, thereby rendering her unavailable to appear at trial in San Francisco.¹ Karlan Decl. ¶¶ 4-6.

¹ Federal courts have determined that travel by a local witness to a location beyond 100 miles from the trial site can render that witness unavailable for trial within the meaning of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 32(a)(4)(B) (“A party may use for any purpose the deposition of a witness, whether or not a party, if the court finds: . . . that the witness is more than 100 miles from the place of hearing or trial or is outside the United States, unless it appears that the witness’s absence was procured by the party offering the deposition. . . .”). See, e.g., *Torres v. Transguard Ins. Co. of Am. Inc.*, No. CV-13-01578-PHX-ROS, 2015 WL 12632029, *5 (D. Ariz. June 26, 2015) (permitting trial deposition of eyewitness who, although within the court’s subpoena power, planned to be more than 100 miles from the trial site during trial); *MMG Ins. Co. v. Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*, 293 F.R.D. 58, 67 (D.N.H. 2013) (permitting use of deposition at trial because witness’s vacation plans more than 100 miles from trial site rendered him unavailable under Rule 32); *Branning v. Wayne County*, No. 3:15-cv-1936, 2018 WL 1998312, *2 (permitting use of deposition at trial of a local witness who had international travel plans during trial).

1 5. Professor Karlan's commitment to teach this course predates this action, and no
 2 party or party's counsel procured her absence during trial. Karlan Decl. ¶¶ 7-8. Professor Karlan
 3 has been a faculty member at this program for several years before this action was filed. *Id.*

4 6. The parties and Professor Karlan have preliminarily agreed to conduct her trial
 5 deposition on December 18, 2018, in Washington, D.C., which will spare Defendants the expense
 6 and inconvenience of traveling to California for a further deposition. Ferrari Decl. ¶ 4.

7 7. The proposed deposition date would precede the final pretrial conference on
 8 January 3, 2019, ECF No. 79 at 2, and provide sufficient time in advance of trial for the parties to
 9 designate Professor Karlan's testimony and interpose objections to such designations.

10 8. Although a number of federal courts have determined that a *de bene esse*
 11 deposition is not subject to the same timing limitations as a deposition for the purpose of
 12 discovery,² in an abundance of caution, the parties hereby seek leave of court to re-open the
 13 discovery period should the Court find it necessary to do so for this limited purpose. Professor
 14 Karlan's unavailability due to her teaching commitment abroad would provide good cause to do
 15 so.

16 **IT IS SO STIPULATED.**

24 2 *De bene esse* depositions "are used at trial in lieu of live testimony, and are not
 25 discovery tools," *Holen v. Jozic*, No. C17-1147JLR, 2018 WL 5761775, *4, n. 4 (W.D. Wash.
 26 Nov. 2, 2018). Accordingly, federal courts have determined that trial depositions need not be
 27 confined to the discovery period. *See, e.g., Charles v. Wade*, 665 F.2d 661, 664 (5th Cir. 1982)
 28 (district court erred in denying trial deposition due to close of discovery period because "the
 requested deposition would not have been taken for purposes of discovery but as the testimony of
 a witness unavailable for trial"); *Spangler v. Sears, Roebuck and Co.*, 138 F.R.D. 122, 124 (S.D.
 Ind. 1991) (close of discovery "does not prevent a party from memorializing a witness' testimony
 in order to offer it at trial"); *Estenfelder v. Gates Corp.*, 199 F.R.D. 351, 352-356 (D. Colo. 2001).

1 Dated: November 30, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

2
3 XAVIER BECERRA
4 Attorney General of California
5 MARK R. BECKINGTON
6 ANTHONY R. HAKL
7 Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN
TODD GRABARSKY
R. MATTHEW WISE
Deputy Attorneys General

8
9
10 Dated: November 30, 2018

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
/s/ Anna T. Ferrari
ANNA T. FERRARI
Deputy Attorney General
*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California, by and
through Attorney General Xavier Becerra*

/s/ Charles L. Coleman
CHARLES L. COLEMAN III, SBN 65496
DAVID I. HOLTZMAN
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP
50 California Street, 28th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 743-6970
Fax: (415) 743-6910
Email: charles.coleman@hklaw.com
Attorneys for Plaintiff County of Los Angeles

Dated: November 30, 2018

MIKE FEUER
City Attorney for the City of Los Angeles

/s/ Valerie Flores
VALERIE FLORES, SBN 138572
Managing Senior Assistant City Attorney
200 North Main Street, 7th Floor, MS 140
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Telephone: (213) 978-8130
Fax: (213) 978-8222
Email: Valerie.Flores@lacity.org

Dated: November 30, 2018

HARVEY LEVINE
City Attorney for the City of Fremont

/s/ Harvey Levine
SBN 61880
3300 Capitol Ave.
Fremont, CA 94538
Telephone: (510) 284-4030
Fax: (510) 284-4031
Email: hlevine@fremont.gov

Dated: November 30, 2018

CHARLES PARKIN
City Attorney for the City of Long Beach

/s/ Michael J. Mais
MICHAEL K. MAIS, SBN 90444
Assistant City Attorney
333 W. Ocean Blvd., 11th Floor
Long Beach CA, 90802
Telephone: (562) 570-2200
Fax: (562) 436-1579
Email: Michael.Mais@longbeach.gov

Dated: November 30, 2018

BARBARA J. PARKER
City Attorney for the City of Oakland
MARIA BEE
Chief Assistant City Attorney

/s/ *Erin Bernstein*
ERIN BERNSTEIN, SBN 231539
Supervising Deputy City Attorney
MALIA MCPHERSON
Deputy City Attorney
City Hall, 6th Floor
1 Frank Ogawa Plaza
Oakland, California 94612
Telephone: (510) 238-3601
Fax: (510) 238-6500
Email: ebernstein@oaklandcityattorney.org

Dated: November 30, 2018

JOHN LUEBBERKE
City Attorney for the City of Stockton

/s/ John Luebberke
SBN 164893
425 N. El Dorado Street, 2nd Floor
Stockton, CA 95202
Telephone: (209) 937-8333
Fax: (209) 937-8898
Email: John.Luebberke@stocktonca.gov

1 Dated: November 30, 2018

DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY
SUE ANN SALMON EVANS
KEITH A. YEOMANS

3 */s/ Keith A. Yeomans*
4 KEITH A. YEOMANS
5 *Attorneys for Plaintiff-Intervenor*
Los Angeles Unified School District

6 Dated: November 30, 2018

MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP

7 By: */s/ Andrew Case*

John F. Libby
John W. McGuinness
Emil Petrossian
Andrew Case (*pro hac vice*)
11355 West Olympic Boulevard
Los Angeles, California 90064
Telephone: (310) 312-4000
Facsimile: (310) 312-4224

12 **LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL RIGHTS
13 UNDER LAW**

14 Kristen Clarke
15 Jon M. Greenbaum
16 Ezra D. Rosenberg
17 Dorian L. Spence
18 1401 New York Avenue NW, Suite 400
19 Washington, DC 20005
20 Telephone: (202) 662-8600
21 Facsimile: (202) 783-0857

22 **PUBLIC COUNSEL**

23 Mark Rosenbaum
24 610 South Ardmore Avenue
25 Los Angeles, California 90005
26 Telephone: (213) 385-2977
27 Facsimile: (213) 385-9089

28 **CITY OF SAN JOSE**

Richard Doyle, City Attorney
Nora Frimann, Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor
San José, California 95113-1905
Telephone Number: (408) 535-1900
Facsimile Number: (408) 998-3131
E-Mail: cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

29 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*
30 **CITY OF SAN JOSE and BLACK ALLIANCE FOR
31 JUST IMMIGRATION**

1 Dated: November 30, 2018

2 JOSEPH H. HUNT
3 Assistant Attorney General

4 BRETT A. SHUMATE
5 Deputy Assistant Attorney General

6 CARLOTTA P. WELLS
7 Assistant Branch Director

8 */s/ Kate Bailey*
9 KATE BAILEY
10 STEPHEN EHRLICH
11 CAROL FEDERIGHI
12 DANIEL HALAINEN
13 Trial Attorneys
14 United States Department of Justice
15 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
16 1100 L Street NW
17 Washington, DC 20530
18 Phone: (202) 514-9230
19 Email: kate.bailey@usdoj.gov
20 *Attorneys for Defendants*

21 **ATTESTATION REGARDING ELECTRONIC SIGNATURES**

22 I, Anna T. Ferrari, attest that all signatories listed, and on whose behalf the filing is
23 submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.

24 Dated: December 3, 2018

25 */s/ Anna T. Ferrari*

26
27
28

DECLARATION OF ANNA T. FERRARI

I, Anna T. Ferrari, declare as follows:

1. I am a Deputy Attorney General with the California Department of Justice, duly licensed to practice law in the State of California. I am counsel of record in this action for the State of California. I make this declaration in support of the parties' Stipulation for Leave to Conduct Trial Deposition of Pamela Karlan. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated herein and, if called upon to do so, could and would testify competently thereto.

2. Professor Karlan, Plaintiffs' expert witness, has submitted an expert report in this action that was disclosed to Defendants on September 19, 2018.

3. Defendants deposed Professor Karlan on October 25, 2018, in Palo Alto, California.

4. Prior to filing this stipulation, counsel for Plaintiffs and Defendants conferred and agreed to conduct Professor Karlan's trial deposition on December 18, 2018, in Washington, D.C., should the Court grant leave to do so.

5. The Court has granted one previous time modification in this case, extending the close of expert discovery from October 11, 2018, to October 26, 2018.

6. The request to reopen discovery for the purpose of conducting Professor Karlan's trial deposition would have no impact upon the scheduling of the case, including its January 7, 2019, trial date.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on November 30, 2018 at San Francisco, California.

/s/ Anna T. Ferrari

Anna T. Ferrari

DECLARATION OF PAMELA S. KARLAN

I, Pamela S. Karlan, declare as follows:

1. I am the Kenneth and Harle Montgomery Professor of Public Interest Law at Stanford Law School. I make this declaration in support of the parties' Stipulation for Leave to Conduct Trial Deposition of Pamela Karlan. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated herein and, if called upon to do so, could and would testify competently thereto.

2. My scholarly specialty is constitutional law and litigation, with a special emphasis on legal regulation of the political process.

3. I have offered expert testimony in this action on behalf of Plaintiffs regarding whether the addition of a citizenship question to the decennial census would assist the Department of Justice in enforcing section 2 of the Voting Rights Act.

4. As party of my official duties at Stanford Law School, I have committed to teach a course for the Bing Overseas Studies Program in Italy during the 2019 winter term.

5. In order to teach at the Bing Overseas Studies Program, I will leave the United States on January 2, 2019, and return to the United States on March 22, 2019.

6. I will be unable to appear in person at trial in San Francisco during this period.

7. This is my second time teaching in this program, and I committed to teach at the program more than 18 months ago, before this action was filed.

8. No party or party's counsel procured my participation on this faculty of the Bing Overseas Studies Program.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on December 3, 2018 at Palo Alto, California.

/s/ Pamela S. Karlan

Pamela S. Karlan

1 [PROPOSED] ORDER

2 Based on the parties' Stipulation for Leave to Conduct Trial Deposition of Expert Witness
3 Pamela Karlan, and good cause appearing, this Court finds that Plaintiffs' expert witness Pamela
4 Karlan is unavailable for trial within the meaning of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 32(a)(4)(B)
5 in light of prior teaching commitments abroad. Accordingly, the parties may depose Professor
6 Karlan at a mutually convenient time and location in advance of trial in order to preserve her trial
7 testimony.

8 **PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

9
10 DATED: _____

11 HON. RICHARD SEEBORG
12 United States District Court Judge

13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28